

Cradle-to-Career Data System Governing Board Meeting

August 10, 2022

This document provides a summary of the key points that emerged from the August 10, 2022 Cradle-to-Career (C2C) Data System Governing Board Meeting. More information about the meeting, including support materials, a recording of the meeting, and the PowerPoint, are available at <https://c2c.ca.gov/board-meetings/>.

The following members attended the meeting:

- Sylvia Alva, California State University
- Marisol Aviña, California Endowment
- Catalina Cifuentes, Riverside County Office of Education
- Deborah Cochrane, Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education
- David DeGuire, Commission on Teacher Credentialing
- Sean Elo-Rivera, San Diego City Council
- Chris Furgiele, University of California
- Danté Golden, alternate for Senator John Laird, California State Senate
- John Hetts, California Community College Chancellor's Office
- Assemblymember Jaqui Irwin, California State Assembly
- Su Jin Jez, California Competes
- Meredith Lee, University of California, Berkeley
- Gavin Payne, GPC Advisors
- Patrick Perry, California Student Aid Commission
- Javier Romero, California Labor and Workforce Development Agency
- Elizabeth Steffensen, alternate for John Ohanian, California Health and Human Services Agency
- Robert Tagorda, Incoming Board Chair, Revival Strategy Consulting
- Thomas Vu, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities
- Wesley Whitaker, alternate for Assemblymember Jaqui Irwin, California State Assembly
- Jerry Winkler, California Department of Education

Welcome

Incoming Board Chair Robert Tagorda, Revival Strategy Consulting, welcomed the group and gave an overview of the agenda.

Executive Director's Remarks

Mary Ann Bates, the Executive Director of C2C, presented an update on C2C. Ms. Bates introduced the new C2C staff:

- Sebastien Chaubard, Associate Governmental Program Analyst (July 11 start date)
- Ryan Estrellado, Director of Data Programs (Aug. 22 start date)
- Dan Lamoree, Director of Data Infrastructure (Aug. 2 start date, previously our Data Architect)
- Shannon Serrato, Director of Engagement (Aug. 22 start date)

She discussed the current open positions: Associate Governmental Program Analyst and the Director of Operations.

She provided an update on the Request for Proposals (RFP). C2C has multiple ongoing procurements. For the System Integrator RFP, the bidder proposals have been evaluated and scored, and C2C is entering the negotiations phase with the bidders. C2C has completed the Project Approval Lifecycle.

Then, Ms. Bates shared an update on C2C's press and engagement efforts, including an announcement from the Governor's Office regarding the participation agreements and articles from EdSource.

She also highlighted work with CaliforniaColleges.edu. It currently works with 144 districts and provides approximately 1 million 6th-12th grade students with accounts on CaliforniaColleges.edu. Students, families, and educators can now track the submission status of California Community College, California State University, and University of California applications for admission, Free

Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA), and California Dream Act applications, within 24 hours of submission.

Lastly, Ms. Bates shared an update on the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act. Due to the recent passage of the Budget Bill for the 2022-2023 fiscal year, C2C has the option of hosting our meetings that are subject to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act via Zoom until July 1, 2023.

C2C Work Plan

Incoming Board Chair Robert Tagorda began the conversation by asking the Board for reflections from the first year.

Meredith Lee acknowledged the effort to build the core team and include a range of perspectives. She explained that it's important to have a team that's consistently rolling up their sleeves every day. She also said that she hopes as the office grows, people who are interested in contributing their perspectives will continue to show up.

Sylvia Alva reflected on the tremendous progress C2C has made in a relatively short period of time. She acknowledged that commitment to building out the infrastructure and the commitment to approaching this work with an esprit de corps and a mindset that will serve C2C well. She thanked Mary Ann for keeping open lines of communication with the board members.

Thomas Vu agreed that C2C did so much in one year. He explained that the board spoke about having trust in the beginning and that the board has shown that this year.

John Ohanian echoed the clear strategy and clear lines of communication and explained that he is very excited about this work.

Then, Mary Ann Bates presented the 5-Year Projected Timeline and the FY2022-23 Annual Work Plan. She explained that it is an ambitious timeline and that there are no extra buffers built in.

Gavin Payne said he loved the idea of a buffer-free zone. There are many dependencies with all the data providers and all the other agencies, and he praised the C2C team for making sure the program can meet the deadlines.

Marisol Aviña explained that she wanted to acknowledge undocumented students and the security of their data. She asked that during the process of matching data with other sources, whether one may be able to conclude that some students are undocumented. She asked how that data is safeguarded.

Mary Ann Bates responded that there is no plan to include immigration status.

Public Comment Regarding the C2C Work Plan

Public comment was given as follows:

Liz Guillen expressed concern about revealing immigration status in the data, and concern for other vulnerable populations.

Raquel Morales, from the Education Trust-West, expressed support for the continued expansion of analytical data sets, especially as it relates to early learning and care data.

Chantal Lamourelle, from Santa Ana College, encouraged the Board to align the verbiage and messaging for the inclusion of preschool and Pre-K, and to include faculty positions at college in the projections of successful early care and education careers.

Roxana Marachi, from San Jose State University, asked will block-chain based IDs be used in the data system?

Molly Esquivel submitted written comments expressing concern that funding should be put toward impactful programs, rather than another data collection system, and asked about privacy measures.

Anna Alvarado, from the California EDGE Coalition, asked that the Board consider including opportunity youth in these conversations.

Motion

Lande Ajose moved to approve the C2C Work Plan. Gavin Payne seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with 20 “yes” votes with one Board Member absent.

Draft Budget Change Concept

Mary Ann Bates presented the draft C2C Budget Change Concept for FY2023-2024 and answered questions from Board Members regarding the proposal.

Public comment on the Draft Budget Change Concept

Molly Esquivel explained that funding should be put toward people who will make a lasting and immediate impact in the lives of students, rather than another data collection and surveillance system.

Motion

Thomas Vu moved to approve the FY2023-24 Draft Budget Change Concept. Sylvia Alva seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with 20 “yes” votes with one Board Member absent.

Executive Director Review Ad Hoc Committee Report Out

Elizabeth Steffensen shared an update from the Executive Director Review Ad Hoc Committee, including the process of the Executive Director Performance Review. Ms. Steffensen also answered questions from Board Members.

Motion

David DeGuire moved to approve the Executive Director Performance Review Process. Chris Fugiuele seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with 19 “yes” votes, one “Yes, with reservations” vote, with one Board Member absent.

Lande Ajose voted “Yes, with reservations”, and submitted an amendment to consider this as a one-year process to see how the ad hoc committee would work.

Task Force Report Outs

Teacher Data Task Force Report Out

David DeGuire presented an update on the Teacher Data Task Force. The Task Force recommended that the scope of the dashboard should be expanded beyond teachers to look at other public K-12 educator roles. The Task Force recommended that C2C work with data providers to craft clear communication about the nature of these discrepancies.

Mr. DeGuire answered questions from Board Members.

Employment Data Task Force Report Out

Jill Leufgen presented an update on the Employment Data Task Force. The Task Force identified several areas for additional investigation to strengthen the methodology, particularly to identify which individuals are no longer in the

California labor market, contextualize earnings by industry of employment, and develop additional measures of economic mobility.

Ms. Leufgen answered questions from Board Members.

Public Comment on the Task Force Report Outs

Liz Guillen asked about whether teacher vacancies should be included at the school site or district. She explained that to address the shortage of teachers, and show patterns of teachers' diversity, reporting at the school site level is critical.

Manny Rodriguez recommended augmenting the UI data set, such as students in career education disciplines. He agrees with connecting C2C with National Student Clearinghouse data to see students who were awarded degrees in other states.

Raquel Morales submitted a written comment uplifting the recommendation that a wide range of stakeholders, including community members, educators, and advocates, be included in the user-centered design process to ensure the data will provide different stakeholders with the information they need. She also wanted to urge the inclusion of data regarding the Pre-K and TK workforce. This data will be especially important given the recent investments in UPK and the tremendous need to hire educators to teach transitional kindergarten, as well as the upcoming launch of the P-3 ECE Credential.

Legislative Report: Preview of Outline

Mary Ann Bates shared information about the upcoming legislative report, including the format and highlights of C2C's work.

Public Comment on the Legislative Report

Molly Esquivel submitted a written comment asking will this concept of data collection be shared with students? What types of transparency measures are you taking with students and teachers? What opt out options are available for those that wish to protect their privacy. There is a rise in those that wish to protect their privacy and want to opt out of data collection and surveillance.

Chantal Lamourelle submitted a written comment to challenge and encourage this group to expand the verbiage to include data points/demographics for funding sources/EDD/data, Workforce development in the state in regards to the early care and education positions (Prek-Tk) within the career. For example, children museum professionals, child life specialists and child development college professors at community colleges and university salaries to be included in data sources.

Anna Alvarado submitted a written comment on behalf of the CA EDGE Coalition. As the board continues to identify additional measures of economic mobility, she asked that opportunity youth are part of the conversations – the 16 to 24 year old population who are disconnected from the education and workforce systems, including foster youth, justice-involved, immigrant youth. This population needs to be elevated in the data system to re-engage them in career readiness and employment opportunities.

Adjournment

Robert Targoda, Incoming Board Chair, adjourned the meeting.