

Cradle-to-Career Data System Governing Board Meeting

May 11, 2022

This document provides a summary of the key points that emerged from the May 11, 2022 Cradle-to-Career (C2C) Data System Governing Board Meeting. More information about the meeting, including support materials, a recording of the meeting, and the PowerPoint, are available at <https://c2c.ca.gov/board-meetings/>.

The following Board Members attended the meeting:

The following members attended the meeting:

- Amy Fong, Board Chair, California School Information Services
- Sylvia Alva, California State University
- Marisol Aviña, California Endowment
- Catalina Cifuentes, Riverside County Office of Education
- Deborah Cochrane, Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education
- David DeGuire, Commission on Teacher Credentialing
- Sean Elo-Rivera, San Diego City Council
- Chris Furgiele, University of California
- Danté Golden, alternate for Senator John Laird, California State Senate
- John Hetts, California Community College Chancellor's Office
- Su Jin Jez, California Competes
- Meredith Lee, University of California, Berkeley
- Gavin Payne, GPC Advisors
- Patrick Perry, California Student Aid Commission
- Javier Romero, California Labor and Workforce Development Agency
- Elizabeth Steffensen, alternate for John Ohanian, California Health and Human Services Agency
- Robert Tagorda, Revival Strategy Consulting
- Thomas Vu, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities
- Wesley Whitaker, alternate for Assemblywoman Jaqui Irwin, California State Assembly

- Jerry Winkler, California Department of Education

Welcome

Government Operations Agency Secretary Amy Tong welcomed meeting attendees and swore in alternates Elizabeth Steffensen and Wesley Whitaker.

Board Chair Amy Fong, California School Information Services, welcomed the group and gave an overview of the agenda.

Public Comment

The public comment portion of the meeting began with Chair Amy Fong reading into the record all written public comments submitted in advance. The following written comments were read aloud for consideration by the members.

Written comment submitted by Jessica Thompson, The Institute for College Access & Success:

Dear Members of the Cradle-to-Career Governing Board:

On behalf of the Institute for College Access & Success (TICAS), I write to express our strong support for the appointment of Marshall Anthony, Jr., Ph.D., to serve as a member of the Data & Tools Advisory Board. Mr. Anthony is a fierce higher education advocate and trained applied researcher who employs quantitative techniques to analyze real-world postsecondary issues, and will bring a unique and valuable perspective to the Advisory Board's work.

The Data & Tools Advisory Board has been charged with the task of helping to ensure that the Cradle-to-Career data tools provide actionable information to all stakeholders. TICAS, which works both nationally and in California and Michigan, is a trusted source of research, design, and advocacy for student-centered public policies that promote affordability, accountability, and equity in higher education. TICAS' deep

roots in California combined with its higher educational data expertise will help guide Mr. Anthony to provide unique strategic guidance in the development and governance of the data system.

As TICAS' Research Director, Mr. Anthony's work aims to interrogate, complicate, and problematize systemic educational disparities to improve the educational and socioeconomic mobility of traditionally underrepresented communities. As a researcher with experience working at the Division of Florida Colleges, he knows how critical student data systems are to properly assess state-level education and workforce systems and address critical equity issues. He is passionate about advocating for data tools that are accessible and understandable to help students, researchers, and policy make informed decisions about education and workforce systems.

For these reasons, we know Mr. Anthony will be instrumental to the Advisory Board and we respectfully urge your support for his appointment.

For questions, please contact Angela Perry at aperry@ticas.org.

Sincerely,

Jessica Thompson

Vice President

The Institute for College Access & Success

Written Comment submitted by the California EDGE Coalition:

Dear Members of the Cradle-to-Career Governing Board:

As organizations representing sectors in education, workforce, labor, business, and social justice, we write to respectfully urge your support for the appointment of Anna Alvarado to serve as a member of the Community Engagement Advisory Board.

As you know, the Community Engagement Advisory Board will create strong feedback loops with data users to support evidence-based decision making, analytical capacity, equitable access, and promote diversity and inclusivity in building engagement with the data system. Last year, Ms. Alvarado served as a member of the Cradle-to-Career Community Engagement Subcommittee, where she provided input and feedback on key outreach strategies, such as helping develop a clear understanding of target audiences; provided input on a communications plan that will raise awareness of the system - why it matters and how to use it. Additionally, Ms. Alvarado provided recommendations to ensure community-based organizations are part of the outreach plan, ensure all communications to users are accessible and available in various languages, and provided input on strategies related to the use of social media and other outreach activities to better engage and inform the public.

As Policy Director for the California EDGE Coalition, Ms. Alvarado represents a coalition of labor, business, education, social justice, and workforce development leaders with a focus on policies that advance economic mobility for adult learners, opportunity youth, workers, and employers. In her role, Ms. Alvarado spearheaded the content development and distribution of key messaging for the data system through informational webinars, news updates, and calls to action in order to raise awareness and engage the public in the decision-making process to establish the system. In addition to public outreach, Ms. Alvarado also led and participated in advocacy strategies to secure funding in the budget for the data system and educated policymakers, legislative staff, and the public on what the data system is and how it will provide communities with critical information to make decisions on college readiness, financial aid planning, employment and earnings outcomes, and pathways in career technical education that lead to degrees, certificates, and credentials.

Most importantly, Ms. Alvarado brings with her lived-experience as a first-generation college graduate, daughter of Mexican immigrant

parents, and an English language learner born and raised in an underserved community in San Jose. She understands the barriers many students and immigrant communities face when seeking resources to access basic needs such as health care, food insecurity, internet access, student financial aid - all things that continue to impact individuals and working families across the state. Ms. Alvarado is passionate about continuing to advocate for tools that are accessible and understandable to help students, adult learners, and opportunity youth make informed decisions on their education and career planning, while also informing policymakers how to improve California's education and workforce systems.

For these reasons, we know Ms. Alvarado will be instrumental to the advisory board and we respectfully urge your support of her appointment.

For questions, please contact Sebastien Chaubard, Program Manager at schaubard@caedge.org.

Sincerely,

Zima Creason, Executive Director California EDGE Coalition

Su Jin Jez, Executive Director California Competes

Peggy B. Wheeler, Vice President, Policy California Hospital Association

John Brauer, Workforce and Economic Development Director California Labor Federation, WED Program

Sean Hughes, Policy Director California Opportunity Youth Network

Linda Collins, Founder and Executive Director Career Ladders Project

Rita Medina, Deputy Director of State Policy and Advocacy Coalition for Humane Immigrant Rights (CHIRLA)

Karina Paredes-Arzola, State Network Manager National Skills Coalition

Chione Flegal, Managing Director PolicyLink

Mark Herbert, California Managing Director Small Business Majority

Jessie Ryan, Executive Vice President The Campaign for College Opportunity

Angela Perry, Director of Policy & Advocacy The Institute for College Access & Success

Edgar Castillo, Senior Manager, Workforce Development Policy & Systems
UNITE-L

Written comment submitted by Public Advocates:

Dear Cradle-to-Career Governing Board Members:

On behalf of Public Advocates, I write to express my strong support for appointing Sbeydeh Viveros-Walton to the Cradle-to-Career System Community Engagement Advisory Board.

Public Advocates is a civil rights legal and advocacy organization committed to eliminating disparities in opportunity for marginalized communities and ensuring that all students have access to a quality education. We have been at the forefront of advocating for the establishment of a Cradle-to-Career System and ensuring that it fulfills its mission to connect students, parents, and institutions to the information it needs to improve educational data systems to drive data-driven policy solutions. As Public Advocates' Director of Higher Education and member of our P-16 Education Equity Team, Ms. Viveros-Walton will harness our statewide community partnerships and coalitions to help shape the implementation of the Cradle-to-Career System.

Ms. Viveros-Walton has dedicated her professional career to connecting people and institutions and has extensive experience in equity-based program development and P-16 education public policy research using qualitative and quantitative data. Additionally, she spent six years leading a place-based Cradle-to-Career initiative focused on educational equity and was responsible for translating these indicators into easy-to-understand public dashboards to keep the community at-large abreast of challenges and success. Ms. Viveros-Walton has demonstrated commitment to improving educational access and quality for California's students and will bring that valuable experience to the Community Engagement Advisory board.

Thank you for your leadership as you work to launch this historic data system to help Californians reach their academic and career goals. If you have any questions or would like to discuss my support further, please contact me at gmayer@publicadvocates.org.

Thank you for your consideration,

Guillermo Mayer President & CEO

Written comment submitted by The California Higher Education Equity Coalition:

Dear Cradle-to-Career Governing Board Members:

On behalf of the California Higher Education Equity Coalition, we write to thank you for your leadership in selecting immensely diverse advisory board members to the Cradle-to-Career System Data & Tools Advisory Board and the Community Engagement Advisory Board. As leading organizations focused on educational opportunity and racial equity, we are proud to see several of our coalition members selected as state leaders to ensure that California has a laser-focus on higher education access, success and the closure of racial and socio-economic equity gaps.

We would like to thank you for the thoughtful selection of a number of our Coalition members and express our continued support for their confirmation to their respective Advisory Boards:

Data & Tools Advisory Board

- Marshall Anthony, Jr., Ph.D., The Institute of College Access and Success (TICAS)
- Vikash Reddy, Ph.D., The Campaign for College Opportunity

Community Engagement Advisory Board

- Anna Alvarado, California EDGE Coalition
- Christopher Nellum, Ph.D., The Education Trust—West
- Sasha Pérez, The Campaign for College Opportunity
- Sbeydeh Viveros-Walton, Public Advocates

Advisory board members are critical in shaping a successful Cradle-to-Career System, helping ensure that the data tools provide actionable information and that the public can use these tools to support evidence-based decision making. These individuals have and will continue to demonstrate a commitment to improving educational access

and quality for California's students and will bring that valuable experience to these boards.

Thank you for your continued leadership as you work to launch this historic data system to help more students reach their college and career goals. We look forward to the groundbreaking work that the Cradle-to-Career System Data & Tools Advisory Board and the Community Engagement Advisory Board will embark on. If you have any questions or would like to discuss our support further, please reach out to Katrina Linden, Senior Legislative Affairs Manager at the Campaign for College Opportunity at katrina@collegecampaign.org or 714.679.9402.

Thank you for your consideration,

The California Higher Education Equity Coalition

Su Jin Jez Executive Director California Competes

Brian Rivas, Senior Director of Policy & Government Relations The Education Trust—West

Zima Creason, Executive Director California EDGE Coalition

Jessica Thompson, Vice President, The Institute for College Access & Success (TICAS)

Jessie Ryan, Executive Vice President Campaign for College Opportunity

Sbeydeh Viveros-Walton Director of Higher Education Public Advocates

The following public comments were shared verbally during the meeting. These notes summarize key points and are not a full transcript of the comments.

Sbeydeh Viveros-Walton advocated for the following individuals to be elected to the advisory boards: Marshall Anthony, Jr., Ph.D., The Institute of College Access and Success (TICAS); Vikash Reddy, Ph.D., The Campaign for College Opportunity Community Engagement Advisory Board; Anna Alvarado, California EDGE Coalition; Christopher Nellum, Ph.D., The Education Trust—West; Sasha Pérez, The Campaign for College Opportunity.

Savannah, from The Campaign for College Opportunity, expressed support for the following candidates: Marshall Anthony, Jr., Ph.D., The Institute of College Access and Success (TICAS); Vikash Reddy, Ph.D., The Campaign for College

Opportunity Community Engagement Advisory Board; Anna Alvarado, California EDGE Coalition; Christopher Nellum, Ph.D., The Education Trust—West; Sasha Pérez, The Campaign for College Opportunity; Sbeydeh Viveros-Walton, Public Advocates

Ines Risales, from Public Advocates, supported Ms. Viveros-Walton's nomination, and the following candidates: Marshall Anthony, Jr., Ph.D., The Institute of College Access and Success (TICAS); Vikash Reddy, Ph.D., The Campaign for College Opportunity Community Engagement Advisory Board; Anna Alvarado, California EDGE Coalition; Christopher Nellum, Ph.D., The Education Trust—West; Sasha Pérez, The Campaign for College Opportunity. Thank you for your consideration of these candidates.

Jackie Nevarez, practitioner in the K-12 space in Sacramento, thanked the Governing Board for her nomination and shared her qualifications for the role.

Mary Munez, Executive Director of College Promise Coalition, supported the proposed slate of members of the Community Engagement Advisory Board, including Ms. Viveros-Walton.

Angela Perry, Director of The Institute for College Access & Success (TICAS), supported the following candidates: Marshall Anthony, Jr., Ph.D., The Institute of College Access and Success (TICAS); Vikash Reddy, Ph.D., The Campaign for College Opportunity Community Engagement Advisory Board; Anna Alvarado, California EDGE Coalition; Christopher Nellum, Ph.D., The Education Trust—West; Sasha Pérez, The Campaign for College Opportunity; Sbeydeh Viveros-Walton, Public Advocates.

Executive Director's Remarks

Mary Ann Bates, the Executive Director of C2C, presented an update on C2C. She explained that sixteen entities signed legal agreements that allow data to be combined to create the analytical data set. Ms. Bates also shared an

update that the Request for Proposals for the tools necessary to build the analytical data set have been released (see: <https://caleprocure.ca.gov/event/0511/0000023405>), and advised the Governing Board and staff to be mindful of communications regarding the solicitation until the vendor has been selected. Then, Ron Marryott, attorney for C2C, explained that the solicitation process will occur over the next five or six weeks. Mr. Marryott advised Board Members to contact Sydney Armendariz if they receive a question from the public or industry about the solicitation.

Next, Ms. Bates shared a hiring update. C2C has posted three senior positions: Director of Data Programs, Director of Data Systems, and Director of Engagement. <https://c2c.ca.gov/careers/>

Ms. Bates gave an update on the California College Guidance Initiative. Through C2C, school districts can now access CCGI's tools for free, which has resulted in many districts seeking to access the platform. By fall 2022, an additional 200,000 students will have access to financial aid, college, and career planning tools and streamlined financial aid and college applications.

Ms. Bates shared information about the launch of monthly community conversations, with the first one on June 8, 2022.

Governance Manual Edits

Board Member, Gavin Payne, presented edits to the Governance Manual proposed by an ad hoc committee of board members. Changes included:

- Agreements Page: lists timing for editing manual, references other documents that create policies
- Preface: specifies the data system purpose, implements a consistent naming convention for the Office of Cradle-to-Career Data
- Governance: revises the image regarding communications and scopes of responsibility for the Office, advisory boards, ad hoc committees, and taskforces

- Roles and Responsibilities Chart:
- Board: adds Executive Director evaluation
- Data & Tools Advisory Board: adds emphasis on continuous improvement for reviewing research requests
- Office: adds support for data request process review, emphasizes data security, adds support for coordination among data providers
- Data Providers: clarify required approval for data usage
- Meetings: describes the scheduling process, attendance expectations, threshold for quorum
- Decision-making: clarifies how alternates are appointed
- Board Chair: describes the responsibilities of the Board Chair Elect and the Standing Chair, outlines the process for running for Board Chair
- Ad Hoc Committees: describes how ad hoc committees are created
- Communications: outlines Governing Board and Office responsibilities
- Managing Entity: emphasizes data security, clarifies lead role in setting security policies, describes how taskforces are created
- Appendix: provides a link rather than text of Bagley-Keene Act

The Governing Board voted on the following motion: Adopt the edits made by the Governance Manual Ad Hoc Committee to the Cradle-to-Career Governance Manual.

Mr. Payne moved to approve the Governance Manual. Ms. Aviña seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously with 20 “yes” votes with one Board Member absent.

Incoming Board Chair Election

Board Chair Amy Fong explained the process for electing a new Board Chair. The incoming Board Chair will begin their term on July 1, 2022. The Board received one letter of interest from Robert Tagorda.

Gavin Payne moved to elect Robert Tagorda as the next C2C Governing Board Chair. Sylvia Alva seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, with one Board Member abstaining (Robert Tagorda), and one Board Member absent (Lande Ajose).

Advisory Board Appointments

Kathy Booth from WestEd provided background information about the Data & Tools Advisory Board and Community Engagement Advisory Board. Mary Ann Bates, Executive Director of C2C, and John Hetts, California Community Colleges, detailed the process of selecting Advisory Board members.

John Hetts explained an issue that arose during the deliberations of whether candidates from organizations represented on the Governing Board can serve on these Advisory Boards. The Ad Hoc Committee recommended that the two candidates, Jacob Jackson from Public Policy Institute of California and Liberty Van Natten from the California Department of Education, who are members of organizations represented on the Governing Board, serve a one-year term.

The board held an extensive discussion about how to identify the types of people that should be prioritized for service on the advisory boards each year. These issues will be addressed by the Governance Manual Ad Hoc Committee in its next round of revisions.

Wesley Whitaker, alternate for Assemblymember Jacqui Irwin, moved to adopt the 16 finalists and 12 named runners-up to the Data & Tools Advisory Board, pending the finalists' acceptance. Thomas Vu, Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities, seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously. Seven Governing Board members voted "Yes, with reservations", and one Board Member was absent (Lande Ajose).

- "Yes, with reservations" Explanations (the following are paraphrased summaries and not direct quotes)

- Sylvia Alva, California State University: C2C does not have a system yet, and is putting things out of order. C2C could benefit from holding off until we have thought through the questions. There is no urgency to vote on this slate.
- Marisol Aviña, California Endowment: There are concerns about the Advisory Board candidates in organizations represented on the Governing Board. There is limited representation of students and families.
- Catalina Cifuentes, Riverside County Office of Education: Understanding what we're going to do in year 1 and year 2; who's missing from this group, especially regarding early outcomes. Having students at the table at the beginning is important.
- Chris Furguele, University of California Office of the President: There are concerns that expertise is not adequately represented and bringing in outside expertise could raise inconsistencies and accountability issues. We need expertise to build the system first, and it's not clear that it's represented in this slate.
- John Hetts, California Community Colleges: Having people in the organization gives an opportunity to rely on and draw from their expertise.
- Wesley Whitaker, alternate for Assemblymember Jacqui Irwin: We should make sure students and families are at the table when making decisions. There is good representation on this slate and will see the formalization about how technical expertise will be brought forward.
- Meredith Lee, University of California, Berkeley: Rather than tagging a specific candidate as community organization versus practitioner, some of the candidates represent value from multiple buckets.

Gavin Payne moved to adopt the 16 finalists and 6 named runners-up to the Community Engagement Advisory Board, pending the finalists' acceptance. David DeGuire, Commission on Teacher Credentialing, seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously. One Governing Board member voted "Yes, with reservations", and one Board Member absent (Lande Ajose).

- "Yes, with reservations" Explanations (the following is a paraphrased summaries and not a direct quote)
 - Marisol Aviña, California Endowment: There is no student or family representation in the candidate slate.

John Hetts, California Community Colleges, moved to adopt the motion, "If an individual declines to be seated or has a conflict of interest, the next runner up will be approached, in the order recommended by the Ad Hoc Committee." Sean Elo-Rivera, San Diego City Council, seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with one Board Member absent (Lande Ajose).

New Ad Hoc Committees and Task Forces

Amy Fong, Board Chair, explained the differences between ad hoc committees and task forces. The Governing Board convenes ad hoc committees, which are subject to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, in-person in Sacramento, and the meetings must comply with process and timeline requirements. The C2C office convenes task forces, which are not subject to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act (as long as two or fewer board members are part of the task force), are open to the public, and typically will meet virtually.

Ms. Fong described the upcoming ad hoc committees:

- Executive Director Review Process
 - Short-term commitment
 - Meetings:
 - Wednesday, June 29th, 9:30am-12pm
 - Monday, July 11th, 9:30am-12pm.
 - Volunteers
 - Wesley Whitaker, alternate for Assemblymember Jacqui Irwin
 - Jerry Winkler, Department of Education
 - Gavin Payne, GPC Advisors

- Elizabeth Steffensen, alternate for John Ohanian, California Health and Human Services Agency
- Meredith Lee, University of California, Berkeley
- Chris Furguele, University of California, Office of the President

Mary Ann Bates, Executive Director of C2C, described the upcoming task forces:

- Security Policy Task Force: security experts from the data providers
- Employment Data and Teacher Data Task Force: data experts from the data providers, researchers, and data experts

Chris Furguele, University of California, Office of the President, recommended a long-term Security Policy task force to underscore the importance of risk management.

Adjournment

Amy Fong, Board Chair, adjourned the meeting.