



# Cradle-to-Career Data and Tools Advisory Board Public Proposal Form

## Instructions:

Per the [Governance Manual](#) proposal forms submitted will address significant gaps regarding whether the data system is providing access to actionable information. Please note there should only be one proposal per form.

## Name:

David Radwin

## Proposal Title: no more than 50 characters

Noncredit Enrollment and Workforce Preparation

- By checking this box, I understand that if a Data and Tools Advisory Board member sponsors my proposal, it will be considered as a submission from the Data and Tools Advisory Board member.

## Type of Proposal<sup>1</sup>:

- Changes to tools such as dashboards or practical tools (*Complete section one*)
- Adding data points not available through the P20W data set or adjusting (including the removal of) the existing P20W data points (*Complete section two*)
- Please note a proposal form(s) can recommend adding one data point or several clearly related data points to the data system.

---

<sup>1</sup> The C2C Governance Manual notes that DTAB members can also submit recommendations related to the data request process. As this is not yet live, it has been removed from the version of this form.

[Section One: Changes to Dashboards or Practical Tools](#)

1. What is the nature of the gap regarding access to actionable information?

2. What type of tool should be developed?

3. How would a tool address the gap?

4. Who would be the likely user(s) of the tool?

5. How does the tool relate to the [mission and vision](#) of C2C?

[Section Two: Adding Data Points Not Available Through the P20W Data Set or Adjusting the Existing P20W Data Points](#)

1. Please state the research question of interest that cannot be fully addressed with the [existing data elements](#) in the P20W Data System.

Which California adults enroll in noncredit education, and how is noncredit enrollment associated with subsequent educational experiences (e.g., enrollment for credit, total credit accumulation, credential attainment), workforce outcomes (e.g., employment, full-time employment, earnings), health outcomes, and use of means-tested public benefits (CalWORKs, CalFresh, Medi-Cal)?

2. How does this research question relate to the [mission and vision](#) of C2C?

To fulfill its mission as the state's authoritative source for actionable education-to-employment data and its vision of supporting evidence-based

policymaking toward equitable outcomes, C2C must offer the most comprehensive possible collection of education data. Noncredit education is a taxpayer-supported enterprise that serves tens of thousands of students each year, many of whom are economically disadvantaged, and all of whom seek to learn skills and improve their and their families' quality of life.

Noncredit education is offered in adult schools and programs operated by K-12 districts, California State University (CSU) Professional and Continuing Education programs, University of California (UC) Extension programs, and, most prominently, the California Community Colleges (CCC). State law recognizes that "The community colleges' mission shall include . . . provision of adult noncredit education curricula in areas defined as being in the state's interest [and that] is an essential and important function of the community colleges" (Cal. Ed. Code 66010.4(a)(2)). Noncredit education is limited to ten categories listed in Cal. Ed. Code 84757(a)(1-10), outlined below.

A 2017 Legislative Analyst's Office report found that noncredit enrollment constitutes five percent of full-time equivalent enrollment statewide, but with substantial variation across districts. At the high end, one district had 32 percent of its FTE enrollment in noncredit offerings.

3. Please propose additional data element(s) needed in order to successfully address the research question of interest.

Category of CCC noncredit enrollment (out of ten categories) by semester or quarter, or if such level of detail is infeasible, by year: (1) parenting; (2) elementary and secondary foundational skills; (3) English as a second language (ESL); (4) citizenship, ESL, and workforce preparation for eligible immigrants; (5) programs for persons with substantial disabilities; (6) short-term vocational programs with high employment potential; (7) programs for older adults; (8) home economics; (9) health and safety education; (10) supervised tutoring for foundational skills and for degree-applicable and transfer-level courses.

4. Please verify that the proposed data element(s) do not already exist in the P20W Data System.

Verified in communication from C2C staff dated October 29, 2024.

5. If the P20W Data System does not currently include the proposed data element(s), can the proposed data element(s) be derived from the existing data element(s) in the P20W Data System?

No.

6. If the P20W Data System does not currently include the proposed data element(s), are there existing data element(s) closely related to the proposed data element(s)? If so, please list them and why they are not sufficient to answer the proposed research question.

C2C does include completion of CCC noncredit certificates, but that measure misses all noncredit enrollment not leading to a certificate. As detailed below, merely increasing the visibility of noncredit students could draw attention to and expand understanding of the role of noncredit education and the students who take these courses, particularly those who do not complete a noncredit credential. Moreover, including noncredit enrollment would enable researchers to study its prevalence, how students pay for it with financial aid, and how it is associated with educational, employment, health, and public benefits outcomes.

7. C2C keeps a [repository](#) of previous data elements that were either a) considered during the planning process or b) proposed through the mechanisms as outlined in the Governance Manual, but were ultimately not included in the P20W, along with related feasibility studies. Do any of the data element(s) being proposed overlap with the data elements in this repository? (New proposals can build on or duplicate prior proposals. It is helpful for proposers to share that context, including prior related feasibility studies.)

No.

8. Are the proposed data element(s) already collected by a state-level entity? For data element(s) already collected, please answer question nine. For data element(s) not collected, please answer question ten.

Yes, by the CCCCCO. Ideally, this proposal would also include CSU and UC noncredit enrollment, as well as adult school enrollment through the California Department of Education (CDE), but these systems do not appear to collect these data at present.

9. [For proposed data element(s) already collected] To the extent possible, please share details pertaining to the proposed data element(s). Relevant details may include but are not limited to: a) corresponding entity that collects and houses the data element(s); b) specific variable name(s) used in the originating data system; and c) timeframe available.

The CCCCCO Management Information System collects noncredit enrollment as element SX03 = 8888 (<https://webdata.cccco.edu/ded/sx/sx03.pdf>, available starting 1989) and noncredit courses by CB04 = N (<https://webdata.cccco.edu/ded/cb/cb04.pdf>, available starting 1989). Element CB22 contains the category of the course content (ESL, short-term vocational, workforce preparation, etc.) (<https://webdata.cccco.edu/ded/cb/cb22.pdf>, available starting 1998). Alternatively, course content could be categorized by Taxonomy of Programs code, the classification of programs and courses used by the CCC (<https://webdata.cccco.edu/ded/cb/cb03.pdf>, available starting 1989). (TOP codes will [transition to the Classification of Instructional Programs codes](#) by fall 2028.)

10. [For proposed data element(s) not collected] Please propose institution(s) that would be most suited for the new data collection effort.

Although not part of this proposal, we encourage the CSU and UC systems and CDE to collect noncredit enrollment for future addition to C2C. If this collection were to take place, ideally the UC and CSU would collect the data

in a similar fashion to the CCC to facilitate analyses across segments.

Likewise, we encourage the California Department of Education to collect noncredit enrollment from K-12 districts that provide postsecondary instruction through adult schools and other programs.

11. Please explain the desired level(s) of grain size for each data element proposed. (i.e., individual-level, institution-level, or other aggregated levels)? Multiple grain sizes may be requested for each proposed data element.

This element would apply to each individual's enrollment at each CCC each term (semester or quarter) or year, or if that is infeasible, to each individual by term or year.

12. Please explain the intended use case(s) for the proposed data elements (i.e., dashboards, query builder, or the research request tool)? Multiple use cases may be requested for each proposed data element.

This element would be beneficial to all use cases that include postsecondary enrollment. At the most basic level, including noncredit enrollment will offer researchers and policymakers a more comprehensive view of community college enrollment. That is, it would make visible tens of thousands of students who are currently not included in C2C.

Even this first step of recognizing noncredit enrollment has significant potential to help student success. Just a few years ago, in the early part of the COVID-19 pandemic, exclusively noncredit students were excluded from the state's emergency grants program because they did not fall into legislation's categories of full-time or part-time enrollment. Similarly, subsidies for broadband internet access were based on eligibility for Cal Grants, but this criterion excluded noncredit students even though many were very low income and often food and housing insecure. Accurately, systematically, and comprehensively measuring noncredit enrollment statewide would better position future student support programs to reach this economically

disadvantaged population.

More specifically, measuring noncredit enrollment would enable researchers to ask and answer the same sorts of questions they do about for-credit enrollment and credential completion.

- How do students combine noncredit and for-credit enrollment, sequentially and overlapping, within and across segments?
- Specifically, how many Californians complete a bachelor's degree and subsequently enroll in noncredit postsecondary education, how many do so in reverse, and how do their labor market outcomes compare?
- How do students use the new "workforce" Pell Grant intended for very short programs, and how do they combine it with other financial aid?
- Which California adults enroll in noncredit education?
- How is noncredit enrollment associated with subsequent educational experiences (e.g., enrollment for credit, total credit accumulation, credential attainment), workforce outcomes (e.g., employment, full-time employment, earnings), health outcomes, and use of means-tested public benefits (CalWORKs, CalFresh, Medi-Cal)?
- How do outcomes for noncredit students vary across colleges and districts? What can these differences tell us about successful program design and implementation?
- How do students combine noncredit enrollment with other workforce preparation programs such as Strong Workforce and adult education?
- How many students apply for and receive credit for noncredit enrollment?
- Given its level of effectiveness and the population it serves, how should noncredit instruction be funded and regulated by the state?

For dashboards, the measure of noncredit enrollment might be collapsed to a small number of meaningful categories with an emphasis on career readiness

(e.g., short-term vocational, workforce preparation, other).